REMARKS

Claims 1 - 17 are presently in the subject application.

Claims 1-6, 9-17 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as being unpatentable over Whitcomb, U.S. Patent No. 6,011,049 ("WHITCOMB"). It is respectfully submitted that these claims are not obvious in view of WHITCOMB.

The deficiencies of WHITCOMB presented in Applicants' Response to the Office Action of January 3, 2002, are reiterated hereat. As previously discussed, WHITCOMB reveals conventional delivery systems, such as tablets, capsules, etc. (WHITCOMB, col. 4, lines 35-41; col. 5, lines 28-33). WHITCOMB does not reveal or recognize the critical considerations involved in the subject invention, namely, the relative concentrations of each drug, the dose requirement of pioglitazone vis-a-vis metformin and the comparative solubility rates and absorption rates of each drug (the subject specification, at page 3, first through fourth full paragraphs). WHITCOMB does not reveal or hint at the unitary core formulation as defined by Applicants.

One of ordinary skill in the art in viewing WHITCOMB would understand and appreciate that WHITCOMB is only revealing a conventional "combination therapy", which involves administering two or more drugs separately. Combination therapy does not involve a mixture of two or more drugs and certainly, not the core formulation as defined by Applicants.

Reference in this regard is made to WHITCOMB, at Figure 8 ("combination therapy"); Figure 11 ("combination therapy"); Figure 12 (..."Combination Therapy"); col. 1, lines 33-34 ("It has now been discovered that **combination therapy** ..." (emphasis added); col. 2, lines 6-26 ("FIG. 8 ... metformin and troglitazone **combination therapy**" ... FIG. 11



...metformin ... troglitazone ... of combination therapy ... FIG. 12 ... metformin and troglitazone ... combination therapy ... (emphasis added)); col. 4, lines 38-41 ("In a preferred embodiment, the sulfonylurea, biguanide, and glitazone are formulated individually and administered in the same manner that each is normally used clinically." (emphasis added)); col. 6, lines 6-13 ("Overview ... troglitazone/glyburide combination therapy ... Patients treated with combination therapy ... (emphasis added)); col. 6, lines 53-54 ("... A greater number of patients treated with troglitazone combination therapy ... (emphasis added)); col. 11, lines 2-3 ("... combination therapy of troglitazone and sulfonylurea appears to be safe ..." (emphasis added)); col. 11, lines 15-17 ("CONCLUSIONS Troglitazone/glyburide combination therapy is well tolerated ..." (emphasis added)); and col. 15, lines 21-24 ("After the initial ... period ... the remaining subjects were dosed with a combination of metformin and troglitazone (1000 mg metformin BID, 400 MG troglitazone QD ..." (emphasis added)).

One of ordinary skill in the art would not be led to Applicants' core formulation from a view of WHITCOMB.

The Examiner states that:

WHEREAS Whitcomb does not teach a first layer and a core covered by at least a portion of the first [layer], it is **understood** by the Examiner that in the combination of piolitazone and metformin, portions of pioglitazone would cover metformin. (emphasis added).

Firstly, a question to be asked is **from what or whom** does the Examiner obtain his understanding. The Examiner has presented not a single authority to establish that such is true. Certainly, a core, at least a portion of which is enclosed by said first layer is not disclosed or hinted at by the "combination of pioglitazone and metformin". *In re GPAC*, 57 F.3d 1573, 35

U.S.P.Q. 2d 1116, 1123 (Fed. Cir. 1995). Ex parte Yamamoto, 57 U.S.P.Q. 2d 1382, 1383-1384 (BPAI 2000).

Secondly, nowhere in WHITCOMB is an **actual** combination of pioglitazone and metformin described. Accordingly, in this regard, certainly the Examiner's understanding could not have come from conjecture?

A "core" is defined in "Webster's Third International Dictionary", (1993) (copy enclosed) as "the central and often fundamental part of a body, mass or construction as distinct from the enveloping part of a difference in nature or by being cut out or separated ..." A "layer" is defined in this dictionary as "a. one thickness, course or fold laid or lying over or under another ... b. stratum, bed ...". Accordingly, **arguendo** assuming that this fertile, imaginative understanding is valid, the "combination" does not form particles which are a core of metformin i.e. a central part of a body, and the pioglitazone does not form a layer "laid or lying over" a portion of a core.

One of ordinary **skill** in the art would not consider or imagine mixed particles as being a core having a layer on a portion thereof. *In re Way*, 514 F.2d 1057, 185 U.S.P.Q. 580, 584 (CCPA 1973).

It is respectfully submitted that claims 1-6, 9-17, are not obvious, under 35 U.S. (§ 103(a), to one of ordinary skill in the art in view of WHITCOMB and allowance of these claims is requested.

Claims 1-17 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as being unpatentable over Rieveley, U.S. Patent No. 6,153,632 ("RIEVELEY"). It is respectfully submitted that these claims are not obvious in view of RIEVELEY.

The deficiencies of RIEVELEY discussed in Applicants' Response to the Office Action mailed on January 3, 2002, are reiterated hereat. Why would one of ordinary skill in the art be led to Applicants' invention as defined in claims 1-17 when RIEVELEY does not reveal or hint at a core formulation; (2) reveals only conventional delivery vehicles (RIEVELEY at col. 6, lines 41-61); (3) does not appreciate the criticality considered in Applicants' inventive core (the subject specification at page 3, first through fourth full paragraphs, especially the fourth full paragraph).

It is respectfully submitted that claims 1-17 are not rendered obvious, under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a), in view of RIEVELEY and allowance of these claims is requested.

In the event the Examiner maintains his final rejection, enclosed is a Notice of Appeal to this rejection.

The Examiner is hereby authorized to call the undersigned attorney of record "collect' on any matter connected with this application. The telephone number is 212-588-0800. In the absence of the undersigned attorney of record, the call will be accepted by any attorney empowered in this application.

Respectfully submitted,

FROMMER LAWRENCE & HAUG LLP Attorneys for Applicants

By:_

Jerome Rosenstock, Esq. Registration No. 25,456

745 Fifth Avenue

New York, New York 10151

(212) 588-0800



UNABRIDERS

បំ**ង**ួតប្រជន្និក្ខុជន ខេត្ត ខេត្ T AVAILABLE S

leor-do-bán \ko(r)da'bān; '=()bān, -()vēn, -ban, -van\ n - s
[Sp — more at CORDOVAN]: cordovan leather
[Sp — more at CORDOVAN]: cordovan leather
[sina + -dn (as in cordobdn of Cordoba, Argentina + -dn (as in cordobdn of Cordoba, Sain)]; of or belonging to Cordoba, Argentina
[MF, dim. of corde string, rope — more at CORD 1 a : an
[MF, dim. of corde string, rope — more at CORD 1 a : an
ornamental cord, braid, lace, or triing used esp, on costumes;
as (1): an ornamental cord entiridated or ribbon worn as a
badge of honor or as a bestrain ord or ribbon worn as a
badge of honor or as a bestrain of an order of knighthood
->sec GRAND CORDON placed at intervals and enclosing
an area to prevent passage b: a barrier of any kind operating
to close off, and the business center of a city/ (protected from
the minimal by a ~ of seven hills—Horace Sutton) c: a
line or circle of persons or objects around any person or place
(a) continued by a single placed at intervals and enclosing
modate the provision merchants—Lewis Mumford d: Commodate the provision merchants—Lewis Mumford d: Comm

OF cordon) + ato (suffix denoting a blow) — more at CORDON]: a scutherly hurricane wind that occurs along the west coast of Mexico when a tropical cyclone passes northward offshore of the control of the control of the cordon o

-suspended from a ceiling inture—called also plantations of cord thre n; a pneumatic tire having a carcass constructed of cord thre n; a pneumatic tire having a carcass constructed of cord thre n; a pneumatic tire having a carcass constructed of cords running parallel to each other and crossed by small threads—thread

in a land the state of the stat

material e: a separate portion of a foundry mold which shapes the interior of a hollow casting or which makes a hole in or through a casting; also: a part of the mold makes a pole in or through a casting; also: a part of the mold makes apparately and inserted for shaping some part of use casting f: a portion removed from the interior of a condition (the holes the interior composition or hid a condition (the holes bored in the ice provided of the formal of the well drilling for geological and chemical analysis) g: the bony proceed and other Schytl) (took a ~ from the well drilling for geological and chemical analysis) g: the bony proceed and of the mass of the hollow strands twist in some kinds of rope — called also heart of the analysis of the hollow strands twist in some kinds of rope — called also heart of the analysis of the hollow strands twist in some kinds of rope — called also heart of the analysis of the hollow strands twist in some kinds of rope — called also heart of the analysis of the hollow strands twist in sould up of thin plates or wires and enclosed in a coil (as in an electromagnet, transformer, or armature) serving to concentrate and intensify the magnetic field resulting from a current in the coil 1; the conducting wire with its insulation in an electric cable but not including mechanical protective covering R: a nodule of the magnetic field resulting from a current in the coil 1; the conducting material forming the central part of structure of the making implements 1: a wall or structure of the structure of the making implements 1: a wall or structure of the making implements 1: a wall or structure of the wall of the structure of a large main type or in the metal base of a street of the contral part of the earth having a radius of the unaffector; the central part of the earth having a radius of the unaffector; the central part of the aerth having a radius of properties from the surrounding mantle and crust 1: the unaffector; the central part of the antivibual structure of the wall of the sur

a salt formation) $\frac{1}{2}$; to to the first formation $\frac{1}{2}$ (to the first formation) of a core core $\frac{1}{2}$ ($\frac{1}{2}$) $\frac{1$

company ...
gang of miners in one shift b: undersome shift tesp. in a mine
4core var of KOR
corean usu cap, var of KOREAN
core barrel n 1: a tube inside a drill pipe and supported by a
bit to receive the core in core boring 2: a tube usu. of iron
on which a foundry loam core is formed
core bit n: a hollow cylindrical bit that is the cutting part of a
core drill
coredout
core drill
coredout
1s, n: an open box in which a foundry core is
formed
...
1No + n [co- + recreation]: recreation en-

core drill
corebox \('\-*\^\ n\): an open box in which a foundry core is formed
co-recreation \('(')\k\\\\\\^\ n\] [co- + recreation]: recreation engaged in jointly by both sexes
cored ad/ 1: having the core removed \('<\mathref{\alpha}\) apples> 2: cast or made with a hollow core (metal type with a \to base) 3: having a core composed of a specified material or character and esp. differing from that of the outry) arracted or character and esp. differing from that of the outry) cored carbon are lost end of a collection of the outry of the outry

FISH la COI-e-go-ni-dae \.e*gono,de\ n pl. cap [NL, fr. Coregonus, type genus + -idae] in some classifications: a family of fishes (order Isospondyli) comprising the freshwater whitefishes and now sus. included among the Salmonidae coi-e-go-nine \kor-go_nine \kor-go_nine \kor-go_nine \kor-go_nine \kor-go_nine \cdots define \kor-go_nine \kor-go_nine \cdots define \kor-go_nine \kor

and now usu. included among the Saimoningae Core-gonino \\kop-\signin, _n\n\ ad | NL. Coregonus + E core-gonino \\kop-\signin \kop-\n\n\ ad | NL. Coregonus + E core-gonino \\kop-\signin \kop-\n\n\n\ ad | NL. Coregonus + E core-gonino \\kop-\signin \kop-\signin \ko

consisting of a sterile stalk of parallel or fascicled hyperstals terminal head of fertile or spore-bearing branches—

consisting of a sterile stalk of parallel or fascicled by the certain terminal head of fertile or spore-bearing branches—one synnema of its old used to be build said for foundry cores core old n : oil used to be build said for foundry cores core opens \(\) \(\text{Lore in the core of the cor

Bret ki dog, Oir cl., OE hund — more at BOUND!: SILES CORGI COTIA pl of CORIUM CO-Ti-B-CEOUS \(\frac{1}{16}\) KOT-\(\frac{1}{26}\) kOT-\(\frac{1}{26}\) dog (LL cortaceus — DES COTIA pl of CORIUM CO-Ti-B-CEOUS \(\frac{1}{16}\) KOT-\(\frac{1}{26}\) in the leather in appearance, texture, or quainty: TOUGH (a ~ leaf) co-Ti-B-CEOUS \(\frac{1}{26}\) kOT-\(\frac{1}{26}\) \(\frac{1}{26}\) \(\frac{1}{26

2 or coriander seed: the ripened dried intil is comean used for flavoring esp. of pickles, curries, confectioneria, is liquors coriander oil n: a colorless or pale-yellow essential debatained from the dried ripe fruit of coriander and used debatained from the dried ripe fruit of coriander and used debata is a flavoring agent.

co-ri-an-droil \kore an.droil \kore \color oig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriandrum)} \) + ol. orig. formed as G koriezzz \(\text{(f. L. coriand

bugs comprising the negree bugs
co-rin-don \ko'rind.n\n -s [F. fr. Tamil kurundam]: coarDUM
(Gazella dorcas)
(Gazella dorca

in style or manner, esp. in literary style corinthian atrium n, usu cap C : an atrium having a peristyle co-rinthian strium n, its man n, usu cap C : an atrium having a peristyle co-rinthian strium \, nitam\ n - 3 usu cap 1 : Corinthian profiligacy or elegance Z : amateur yachting corinthian pink n, often cap C : a moderate pink to light grayish red that is very slightly darker than liliac (sense 3) usu pink n, often cap C : a grayish purplish red that is redder and corinthian order. A corinthian purple n, often cap C : a grayish purplish red that is redder and deeper than so age rose pum, redder and slightly less strong than manner and redder and duller than tournaline pink n could than bois de rose or Pompeian red, yellower and chird than appleblossom, and deeper than livid tournaline pink of coriolis acceleration \(\frac{(\phi)\text{or}\text{o



laxatif, fr. laxatif, adj.] : a laxative s [prob. fr. (assumed) NL laxismus, + -ismus -ism]: a viewpoint in the that in a conflict between liberty tole argument for liberty suffices to

ble argument for liberty suffices to
— compare PROBABLISM 2

>b. fr. (assumed) NL laxitat, fr. L

iever in laxism

n-ES [L laxitat-, laxitas spaciousness, cious + -tat-, lax-iv]; the quality

3; LOGENESS (a certain ~ of bowels)

>in his grip); lack of strictness (a certain of strictness (a certain of the compared of the compared of the certain of t

er aid: laying: lays [ME layen, leggen, 16] eggen to lay, ON leggla. Goth roth of leggen to lay, ON leggla. Goth roth of leggen to lay on leggen, and leggen to lay on leggen to

AMBUSH: that lies or is laid or as if laid: as : WAGER C obs: CHANCE, RAZARD uniary tax levied by local authority COVERT, LAIR 38: line of action business or work: OCCUPATION

4 a : terms of sale or employment : PRICE (he sold his farm at a good ~ b : a share of the profit of a venture (as on a whaling or fishing vessel) paid wholly or partly in lieu of vessel or employment on shares 6 a : a strip or layer of the profit of a venture (as on a whaling or fishing vessel) paid wholly or partly in lieu of vessel or employment on shares 6 a : a strip or layer of the profit of the profit of the profit of the profit of cloth on which patterns are laid out by cutters in the parameter of cloth on which patterns are laid out by cutters in the parameter of the profit of cloth on which patterns are laid out by cutters in the parameter of the profit of cloth on the profit of cloth of cloth on the profit of cloth of cloth of cloth on the profit of the strands - see HARD LAY, LONG LAY, EMPLIA LAY, LONG LAY, LONG LAY, EMPLIA LAY, LONG LAY, EMPLIA LAY, LONG LAY, LONG

coscillates and carries the reed, shuttle boxes, and batten our interprocess of beating up; speel!: the batten of a loom that beats up the newly laid filling 2 Scot: *1ATHE 1 lay abbot n: a layman holding title to an abbey and its revenues lay about vi 1: to strike in all directions: hit out at random 2: to take steps in preparation: seek means: go about laya.nd \(\) [18y-in, n] playand or layands usu cap [Sp, of Amerind origin] 1: an Arawakan people living opposite the mouth of the Apa river in Paraguay 2: a member of the Layand people lay analyst n: a psychoanalyst who is not a physician lay asside vi [ME leven aside, fr. leven to lay + aside] 1: to poll to fue to oronsideration: DISCARD, BANDON, SHELVE Olay asside vi [ME leven aside, fr. leven to lay + aside] 1: to poll to fue to consideration: DISCARD, BANDON, SHELVE Olay aside active to lay a few dollars aside each week). Lay away vi [ME leven away, fr. leven to lay + away] 1: to lay aside 2: to store for preservation or future use 2: reserve, save (able to lay a few dollars aside each week). Lay away vi [ME leven away, vir. leven to lay + away] 1: to lay aside 2: to store for preservation or future use 3: to spread (indes) flat in tanning liquor 4: Bury, Invre 5 a: to put (specified cards) in the crib in cribbage b: to bury (specified cards) or cards worth a specified number of points) layway \(\) \(

fastened
lay corporation n: a corporation composed of laymen and organized for other than spiritual purposes — contrasted with ecclestastical corporation
lay day n [prob. fr. [lay] 1: one of the days allowed by the charter party for loading or unloading a vessel — compare DEMURRAGE 2: a day of delay in port
lay deacon n: one in deacon's orders who engages in secular occupations

DEMURRAGE 2: a cay of delay in port lay deacon n: one in deacon's orders who engages in secular occupations lay down vi 1: to put aside or give up (something borne): SURRENDER (called on them to lay their arms down) (laid down his kingly power) 2 obs; to put down as a wager, stake, or payment 3 a; to construct or put in place the foundation or main framework or features of (inherited tendencies ... do not operate as they do in birds or anis to lay down inextorably his whole way of life—Ruth Benedict) b; ESTABLISH, PRESCRIES (lays down common codes for reporting so that all countries understand each other's messages — J.M.Stags) (scale laid down for a map) c: to assert or command odge (scale laid down sa a maxim, that wherever a great deal can be used to the down of the law) of the lay of the

nummy
lay-down *...\ adj [lay down] of a collar : turned over laydown *...\ adj [lay down] : the arrangement of rilly

of book sections in sequence preparatory to gathering — called also layout 2: LAY &C 3: a declarer's hand in bridge that is so easily able to fulfill his contract that he might or does expose it and claim the required number of tricks lay elder n [*lay]: *ELDER &D 1 ** [*lay-et]* [*lay

A data Eng; a lieto in which a giass and a giast copy min planted together with the grass crop growing up after the grain is harvested. D archale; earth suitable for cultivation: Soil. 6: La2 bb 5 bb; an artificial oyster bed 6: a pit of strong tanning liquor into which hides are put on coming from the handle? "N be ED-Nol-3 vi to propagate (a plant) by means and the propagate (a plant) by means of layers—see AR LAYEBING. MARCOT AGE — 1: 1: separate into layers — see AR LAYEBING. MARCOT AGE — 1: 1: 1: separate into layers — (mists — with the ground (many brambles spread by — log under natural conditions) layering eap. (a arti, ear.) n s; the practice or art of layering plants layer board n: a board support for lead roof gutters layer board n: a board support for lead roof gutters layer board n: a board support for lead roof gutters layer cake n: a fancy cake that is in layers held together by a sweet filling and that is usu, covered with frosting lay-ered (life()), [e(s)]nd, [e-d\] ad [[layer + ed]; having layers arranged in or divided into layers; covered in layers (a relief many in ight color) have in the shading or coloring of the areas between contour lines of a map in a manner suggestive of progressive change for emphasizing or clarifying differences in elevation lay-er-man \— a coloring for emphasizing or clarifying differences in elevation lay-er-man \— a coloring the approximation of layers—on [lay on + -er] Brit: a water who lays out articles for sorting ear body for burnal b cone who lays out articles for sorting ear body for burnal b cone who lays out articles for sorting ear body for burnal b cone who lays out articles for sorting ear body for burnal b cone who lays out articles for sorting ear body for burnal b cone who lays out articles for sorting ear body for burnal b cone who lays out articles for sorting ear body for burnal b cone who lays out articles for sorting ear body for burnal b cone who lays out articles for sorting ear body for burnal b cone with a lay up; a crampa; lameness or leg we

3: the application of a spiritual heater's hands to the patient body laying press n: LYING PRES. I laying top n: a conical grooved wooden block placed between the strands in laying a rope laying the 'v.-k' n' [luy]: a glazed panel usu, set flush with the ceiling for admitting natural or artificial light lay-lock '(laik, d. alikk 'dai var of LLAC lay lord n: a British peer who is not a law lord lay lord n: a British peer who is not a law lord lay low n: a British peer who is not a law lord lay low to the balloon of 2: to knock out of a fight sate likely to lay low the balloon of 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo had laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo him laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo him laid him low) 3: km. (laid low six or section (flo him laid him laid

tails of from the clergy 2: one not belonging to some particular profession or not expert in some branch of knowledge of all and profession or not expert in some branch of knowledge of all and profession or not expert in some branch of knowledge of all and profession or not expert in some branch of knowledge of all and profession or not expert in some branch of knowledge of all and profession or at LIFL via the conceal, or at LIFL via the profession of the supplementation of the profession of the supplementation of the profession of the profession of the supplementation of the profession of the prof

